

Zero-energy plane waves in conformal gravity

Luca Fabbri^{1,2*} and M. B. Paranjape^{1†}

¹*Groupe de physique des particules, Département de physique,
Université de Montréal, C.P. 6128, succ. Centre-ville, Montréal, Québec, Canada H3C 3J7 and*

²*Theory Group, I.N.F.N. & Department of Physics,
University of Bologna, Via Irnerio 46, C.A.P. 40126, Bologna, Italy*

We consider monochromatic, plane gravitational waves in a conformally invariant theory of general relativity. We show that the simple, standard ansatz for the metric, usually that which is taken for the linearized theory of these waves, is reducible to the metric of Minkowski space-time via a sequence of conformal and coordinate transformations. This implies that we have in fact, exact plane wave solutions, however they are simply coordinate/conformal artifacts. As a consequence, they carry no energy.

PACS numbers: 04.20.-q, 04.20.Cv, 04.20.Jb, 04.30.Nk, 04.50.-h

I. INTRODUCTION

Einstein gravity explains most of the observed gravitational phenomena in the universe, however a few observations appear to lie outside of the reach of its explanatory power, without a drastic modification of the matter content. Since such a modification is not reasonable for luminous matter, as observational data greatly constrain the possibility to tinker with the distribution and quantity of luminous matter, Einsteinian relativity is salvaged via the addition of copious quantities of dark matter and energy. This situation is epistemologically unsatisfactory and some effort has been made to investigate alternative theories of relativity. The geometrical structure of Einsteinian relativity can be enriched by imposing the principle of scale invariance, and this in fact implies a unique gravitational action in 4 dimensions: the corresponding theory is called Weyl gravity. Weyl gravity can be used to explain the remaining observed phenomena - those not well described by Einstein gravity and the existing spectrum of luminous matter (see for example [1], [2], [3]).

Gravitational waves are inescapable predictions of Einsteinian relativity, and their indirect observation has already been rewarded with a Nobel prize [4], although their direct detection is still a decade away in principle. Of course, when entertaining alternative theories of gravity, one would then be very interested in elaborating the existence of such waves. Here we begin such an investigation for Weyl gravity.

II. WEYL GRAVITATIONAL PLANE WAVES

A. Weyl gravity

The general structure of Weyl gravity is given by a metric $g_{\mu\nu}(x)$ which is a coordinate tensor and which transforms as $g_{\mu\nu}^c(x) = \Omega^2(x)g_{\mu\nu}(x)$ for a conformal transformation specified by $\Omega(x)$. The metric gives rise to the Levi-Civita connection $\Gamma_{\mu\nu}^\rho(x)$ the Riemann tensor $R_{\alpha\mu\sigma\rho}(x)$ and the Weyl conformal tensor $C_{\alpha\mu\sigma\rho}(x)$ (for the notation throughout this paper we will follow [5], see also [6]). The importance of Weyl conformal tensor lies in the fact that it is covariant under both coordinate and scale transformations; moreover, in 4 and higher dimensional space-times, it vanishes if and only if there exists a combination of these two transformations for which the metric $g_{\mu\nu}$ can be brought to $\eta_{\mu\nu}$ the metric of flat Minkowski space-time.

The Riemann tensor is not conformally covariant, hence it contains gauge artifacts that are removable by conformal transformations. The Weyl conformal tensor on the other hand is conformally covariant, $C_{\alpha\mu\sigma\rho}(x) \rightarrow \Omega(x)^2 C_{\alpha\mu\sigma\rho}(x)$. Hence it is the fundamental object that contains all information about the geometrical background. In 4 dimensional geometries the dynamics is uniquely determined by

$$\mathcal{L} = C_{\alpha\mu\sigma\rho}C^{\alpha\mu\sigma\rho} + k\mathcal{L}^{\text{matter}} \quad (1)$$

*Electronic address: luca.fabbri@bo.infn.it

†Electronic address: paranj@lps.umontreal.ca

which gives rise to field equations of the form

$$W_{\mu\nu} = -\frac{k}{4}T_{\mu\nu}^{\text{matter}} \quad (2)$$

where $W_{\mu\nu}$ is the Bach conformal tensor

$$W_{\mu\nu} = \nabla^2 R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{3}\nabla_\mu \nabla_\nu R - \frac{1}{6}g_{\mu\nu}\nabla^2 R + 2R^{\alpha\beta}(R_{\beta\nu\alpha\mu} - \frac{1}{4}g_{\mu\nu}R_{\alpha\beta}) - \frac{2}{3}R(R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{4}g_{\mu\nu}R) \quad (3)$$

and k is a constant related to the gravitational constant and $T_{\mu\nu}^{\text{matter}}$ is the energy-momentum tensor of the matter fields.

B. Monochromatic plane waves

To investigate wave solutions of a set of field equations, the usual approach followed in Einstein gravity consists of taking a linear perturbation of the form

$$g^{\mu\nu} = \eta^{\mu\nu} + \varepsilon^{\mu\nu}F(kx) \quad (4)$$

where $kx \equiv k_\mu x^\mu = \omega(t - x)$, ω a constant frequency, and where the propagation vector is to be light-like (see for example [7]). The perturbing term is assumed to be small when considering the linearized theory, usually higher order corrections are not examined. Clearly, it is of interest to consider such perturbations in Weyl gravity. Infact, we will find that (4) is actually an exact, albeit trivial, solution to the full non-linear field equations with no assumption of perturbation.

We will impose two gauge conditions, one fixing coordinate transformations while the other fixing conformal rescalings. We impose

$$\Gamma^\rho \equiv \Gamma_{\mu\nu}^\rho g^{\mu\nu} = -\frac{1}{\sqrt{|g|}}\partial_\mu(\sqrt{|g|}g^{\mu\rho}) = 0 \quad (5)$$

which is called the harmonic gauge ([7]) essentially fixing coordinate transformation (up to harmonic coordinate transformations). We further impose the conformal gauge condition

$$g^{-1} \equiv \text{Det}(g^{\mu\nu}) = -1 \quad (6)$$

which completely fixes the conformal transformations. Within this choice of conformal gauge the harmonic gauge reduces to

$$\partial_\mu g^{\mu\nu} = 0 \quad (7)$$

which is considerably simpler.

With these choices, a plane wave propagating along the x_1 direction has a wave vector given by

$$(k_\mu) = (1, -1, 0, 0). \quad (8)$$

The specific functional dependence of $F(kx)$ implies that $\partial_\mu F(kx) = k_\mu F'(kx)$, where the prime denotes derivation with respect to the argument of the function F .

Then, it is easy to see that the general solution for $\varepsilon^{\mu\nu}$ that satisfies gauge conditions (6), (7) is given by

$$(\varepsilon^{\mu\nu}) = \begin{pmatrix} a & a & b & c \\ a & a & b & c \\ b & b & 0 & 0 \\ c & c & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \quad (9)$$

and with a little calculation we find, in fact for any $F = F(kx)$ a generic differentiable function,

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} - \varepsilon_{\mu\nu}F - (b^2 + c^2)k_\mu k_\nu F^2 \quad (10)$$

where

$$(\varepsilon_{\mu\nu}) = \begin{pmatrix} a & -a & -b & -c \\ -a & a & b & c \\ -b & b & 0 & 0 \\ -c & c & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix} = (\eta_{\mu\sigma}\eta_{\nu\tau}\varepsilon^{\sigma\tau}). \quad (11)$$

As mentioned above, the harmonic gauge condition (6) does not completely fix the possible choice of coordinates; there exist coordinate transformations that preserve this gauge choice. For a coordinate transformation of the form

$$x'^\mu = x^\mu + \varepsilon^\mu \Phi(kx) \quad (12)$$

where $\Phi(y) = \int^y dz F(z)$, the indefinite integral of F , we get

$$\frac{\partial x'^\mu}{\partial x^\nu} = \delta_\nu^\mu + \varepsilon^\mu k_\nu F, \quad (13)$$

which is easily seen to preserve the harmonic gauge [7]. The conformal gauge is then, in general, not respected. However, with the choice of ε^μ given by

$$(\varepsilon^\mu) = \begin{pmatrix} A \\ A \\ B \\ C \end{pmatrix} \quad (14)$$

it is easily verified that the conformal gauge condition (7) is also respected. The crucial point of this paper is that the harmonic coordinate transformation, corresponding to the specific choice

$$(\varepsilon^\mu) = -\frac{1}{2} \begin{pmatrix} a \\ a \\ 2b \\ 2c \end{pmatrix} \quad (15)$$

brings the metric given in (4) and (10) to $\eta_{\mu\nu}$, the flat Minkowskian form.

Thus, monochromatic plane wave fluctuations of the metric about flat Minkowski space-time are indeed solutions of the exact Weyl field equations. But they are trivial solutions: they are gauge (coordinate and conformal) equivalent to the vacuum itself, and nothing more. In particular, if the linearized approximation to Weyl conformal gravity makes sense, then this approximation simply does not admit gravitational wave phenomena. Clearly a linearized approximation admits the ansatz (4), the general ansatz being a linear superposition of such waves. Again, linearized superpositions of harmonic coordinate transformations (15), will bring the metric to the flat metric. Thus gravitational waves in Weyl gravity could only possibly exist in non-linear superpositions, where specifically the non-linear terms are not neglected.

A simple calculation of the connection gives the result

$$\Gamma_{\alpha\beta}^\mu = -\frac{1}{2} F' (k_\alpha \varepsilon_\beta^\mu + k_\beta \varepsilon_\alpha^\mu - k^\mu \varepsilon_{\alpha\beta}) \quad (16)$$

which vanishes by the harmonic transformations above and its Riemann tensor is given by

$$R_{\mu\alpha\rho\beta} = -\frac{1}{2} F'' (k_\rho k_\alpha \varepsilon_{\mu\beta} - k_\alpha k_\beta \varepsilon_{\mu\rho} - k_\rho k_\mu \varepsilon_{\alpha\beta} + k_\beta k_\mu \varepsilon_{\alpha\rho}) \quad (17)$$

which is identically zero, as it should be, before or after doing the harmonic coordinate transformations.

C. Rotationally invariant waves

It is worth noticing that if we start from the metric with lower indices, of the form

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} + \varepsilon_{\mu\nu} F(kx) \quad (18)$$

and impose the gauge conditions (6) and (7) then we find, after some calculation, that the only form allowed is

$$g_{\mu\nu} = \eta_{\mu\nu} - a k_\mu k_\nu F \quad (19)$$

with

$$g^{\mu\nu} = \eta^{\mu\nu} + ak^{\mu}k^{\nu}F \quad (20)$$

for any generic differentiable function $F = F(kx)$. This corresponds to imposing symmetry under rotations in the plane orthogonal to the direction of propagation, in the ansatz (4). Imposing such a symmetry is much more restrictive than our analysis above considering the fluctuations of $g^{\mu\nu}$, as it reduces the possible metric fluctuations to only contain longitudinal waves. For such metrics, transformations of the form

$$\frac{\partial x'^{\mu}}{\partial x^{\nu}} = \delta_{\nu}^{\mu} - \frac{a}{2}k^{\mu}k_{\nu}F \quad (21)$$

can be performed while preserving the gauge choices, and these bring the metric to the trivial form.

III. CONCLUSIONS

We have shown that monochromatic plane waves given by the ansatz (4) are actually conformally and coordinate equivalent to flat Minkowski space-time. This generalizes to all orders the result found to second order in [8] that linearized plane waves carry no energy to second order in Weyl gravity. However the general result follows from the unexpected discovery that such fluctuations are actually trivial, they are just conformal and coordinate artifacts. The energy-momentum tensor of gravitational phenomena in alternative theories of gravity, and specifically here in Weyl gravity has been given in [9]

$$T_{\mu\nu}^{\text{gravity}} = (\partial^2 R_{\mu\nu}^{\text{linear}} - \nabla^2 R_{\mu\nu}) - \frac{1}{3}(\partial_{\mu}\partial_{\nu}R^{\text{linear}} - \nabla_{\mu}\nabla_{\nu}R) - \frac{1}{6}(\eta_{\mu\nu}\partial^2 R^{\text{linear}} - g_{\mu\nu}\nabla^2 R) - 2R^{\alpha\beta}(R_{\beta\nu\alpha\mu} - \frac{1}{4}g_{\mu\nu}R_{\alpha\beta}) + \frac{2}{3}R(R_{\mu\nu} - \frac{1}{4}g_{\mu\nu}R). \quad (22)$$

Since our solution is valid for any strength of the fluctuation, the Weyl gravitational field equations must be valid order by order in the parameter corresponding to the strength of the fluctuation. The result in [8] was an explicit verification of this fact for the second order terms. Here we have shown that each order vanishes exactly. How this is related to zero energy theorems in Weyl gravity is not clear [10].

We are not able to conclude from the analysis presented here that the full Weyl gravity does not contain gravitational wave phenomena. We can only make this conclusion for its linearized approximation. We have shown that a single, monochromatic wave does not exist to all orders in Weyl gravity, and their linearized superpositions treated to linear order are also coordinate/conformally equivalent to flat. However we have not shown that the full non-linear superpositions of waves of the form (4) are trivial. If this were true, it would mean that Weyl gravity contains no gravitational waves and would give rise to serious doubts of its viability as an alternative theory of gravity, especially if the direct detection of gravitational waves ensues.

Acknowledgments

We thank NSERC of Canada for financial support.

-
- [1] P. D. Mannheim and D. Kazanas, *Astrophysical Journal*, **342**, 635 (1989).
 - [2] P. D. Mannheim, *Gen. Rel. Grav.*, **22** 289 (1990).
 - [3] P. D. Mannheim, *Phys. Rev. D* **58**, 103511 (1998).
 - [4] R. A. Hulse and J. H. Taylor, *Astrophys. J.* **195**, L51 (1975).
 - [5] A. Edery, Luca Fabbri, and M. B. Paranjape, *Class. Quantum Grav.*, **23**, 6409 (2006).
 - [6] Luca Fabbri, arXiv:0806.2610 [hep-th].
 - [7] S. Weinberg, “Gravitation and cosmology” (John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1972).
 - [8] J. Bouchami and M. B. Paranjape, *Phys. Rev. D* **78**, 044022 (2008).
 - [9] S. Deser and B. Tekin, *Phys. Rev. D* **75**, 084032 (2007).
 - [10] D. G. Boulware, G. T. Horowitz and A. Strominger, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **50**, 1726 (1983).